

湯德宗 著

# 憲法結構與動態平衡

## 權力分立新論 卷一

2014 增訂四版



天宏出版社  
天宏

2014 Fourth Edition

# Constitutional Structure and Dynamic Balance

Separation-of-Powers Doctrine Revisited  
Volume I

By

**DENNIS TE-CHUNG TANG**

The Honorable Justice  
Judicial Yuan (Constitutional Court)

Distinguished Research Fellow & Founding Director  
Institutum Iurisprudentia, Academia Sinica  
Professor of Law, National Taiwan University  
Taipei, Taiwan

ISBN 978-986-86987-6-5



Tanhong Press

天宏

獻給

恩師翁岳生教授

湯德宗 著

憲法結構與動態平衡  
權力分立新論（卷一）

2014 增訂四版

Constitutional Structure and  
Dynamic Balance  
Separation-of-Powers Doctrine Revisited

Volume I

FOURTH EDITION

By

DENNIS TE-CHUNG TANG

The Honorable Justice  
Judicial Yuan (Constitutional Court)

Distinguished Research Fellow & Founding Director  
Institutum Iurisprudentia, Academia Sinica  
Professor of Law, National Taiwan University

Taipei, Taiwan  
TANHONG PRESS, 2014  
2014

# 憲法結構與動態平衡

權力分立新論 卷一

## 目次

表次.....	iv
圖次.....	v
論九七修憲後的憲法結構	
-- 憲改工程的另類選擇.....	1
(附英文摘要).....	50
新世紀憲改工程	
-- 「弱勢總統制」改進方案.....	53
(附英文摘要).....	98
憲法結構與違憲審查	
-- 大法官釋字第五二〇號解釋評釋.....	101
(附英文摘要).....	170
大法官有關行政、立法兩權關係主要解釋析論.....	173
(附英文摘要).....	238
論直接民主的制度設計	
-- 行政院版「創制複決法」草案評析.....	241
(附英文摘要).....	320
三權憲法、四權政府與立法否決權	
-- 美國聯邦最高法院 <i>INS v. Chadha</i> 案評釋.....	323
(附英文摘要).....	392

## 表 次

論兩岸關係條例第九十五條之合憲性	
-- 憲法第五十七條闡微.....	395
(附英文摘要).....	431
美國權力分立的理論與實務	
-- 我國採行總統制可行性的初步考察.....	435
(附英文摘要).....	466
憲法結構與憲法解釋.....	469
「三一九槍擊事件真相特別調查委員會條例」釋憲案 鑑定意見書(一)：大法官得否命「暫時停止適用」法律....	507
鑑定意見書(二)：真調會條例是否違憲.....	535
附大法官釋字第五八五號解釋(節錄).....	559
「行政院停止執行核四預算」釋憲案審查會意見書.....	567
附大法官釋字第五二〇號解釋(節錄).....	581
「副總統兼任行政院長」釋憲案鑑定意見書.....	591
附司法院大法官書記處函.....	599
附大法官釋字第四一九號解釋(節錄).....	600
附立法委員饒穎奇等八十位聲請書(節錄).....	602
事項索引.....	605
案例索引.....	617

我國中央政府體制更迭一覽表.....	47
大法官有關行政、立法兩權關係解釋案要旨.....	231
創制複決的類型.....	304
國家決策架構與人民擁有主權功能.....	305
總統選舉與創制複決主要門檻之比較.....	306
「必要暨適當」標準之應用.....	428
大法官現行違憲審查職權分析.....	533

## 圖 次

我國中央政府體制更迭示意圖.....	49
美國憲法中的三權分立與制衡： “野心必須用野心加以對抗”.....	96/ 429
我國憲法中的五權分立制衡： “五權分治平等相維”.....	97
國民主權原則與直接民主制度.....	307
三權制衡下“共管”之第四權.....	391/ 430
美國總統制三權分立、相互制衡的憲法結構.....	503
英國內閣制結構示意圖.....	504
憲法本文的「修正式」內閣制.....	505
九七憲改後的「弱勢總統制」.....	506
行政、立法兩權制衡機制.....	578
美國行政、立法兩權制衡機制.....	579
美國與台灣行政、立法兩權制衡機制之比較.....	580

## CONSTITUTIONAL STRUCTURE AND DYNAMIC BALANCE Separation-of-Powers Doctrine Revisited

### Volume I

#### TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
List of Tables.....	x
List of Figures.....	xi
On the Constitutional Structure after the 1997 Constitutional Reform: Alternating Presidentialism as an Alternative.....	1
(English Abstract).....	50
Constitutional Reform for the Millenium: Renovating the Extant Weak Presidentialism.....	53
(English Abstract).....	98
Constitutional Structure and Judicial Review of Constitutionality: A Critical Review of the Council of Grand Justices' Interpretation No. 520 (the 4 <sup>th</sup> Nuclear Power Plant Construction Dispute).....	101
(English Abstract).....	170
A Critical Review of the Leading Interpretations of the Council of Grand Justices over the Relationship between Executive and Legislative Branches.....	173
(English Abstract).....	238

Shaping Direct Democracy: A Comment on the Draft Initiative and Referendum Act of 2001.....	241
(English Abstract).....	320
A Three-Branch Constitution, A Four-Branch Government and Legislative Vetoes: A Critical Review of <i>INS v. Chadha</i> .....	323
(English Abstract).....	392
On the Constitutionality of the Legislative Veto in Section 95 of the Statute Governing the Civil Relationships between the People of the ROC and PRC: What a “Modified Parliamentary System” Means.....	395
(English Abstract).....	431
The Doctrine of Separation-of-Powers in the United States of America: A Preliminary Reflection on the Feasibility of Adopting a Presidential System in Taiwan.....	435
(English Abstract).....	466
Constitutional Structure and Constitutional Interpretation.....	469
Expert Testimony at the Council of Grand Justices on the Constitutionality of the Act for Establishing the Special Commission to Investigate the Authenticity of the 3/19 Gunshot Event on the Eve of the Presidential Election	
Part I: Are Justices Empowered to Issue a Preliminary Injunction to Suspend the Act under Review?.....	507
Part II: Does the Act Run Afoul of the Constitution?.....	535
Attachment: Excerpt of Interpretation No. 585 of the Council of Grand Justices (December 15, 2004).....	559
Expert Testimony at the Council of Grand Justices on the Constitutionality of the Unilateral Decision by the Executive Yuan to Suspend Implementing the Statutory Budget	

Passed by the Legislative Yuan for the Construction of the Fourth Nuclear Power Plant.....	567
Attachment: Excerpt of Interpretation No. 520 of the Council of Grand Justices (January 15, 2001).....	581
Expert Testimony Submitted to the Council of Grand Justices on the Constitutionality of the Vice President Concurrently Serving as Premier.....	591
Attachment: Excerpt of Interpretation No. 419 of the Council of Grand Justices (December 31, 1996).....	600
Subject Index.....	605
Case Index.....	617

## List of Tables

Evolution of the ROC Constitutional Structure.....	47
Summary of the Interpretations of the Council of Grand Justices over the Relationship between the Executive and Legislative Branches.....	231
Types of Referendum.....	304
Framework of National Decision-Making and Function of the Sovereignty Possessed by the People.....	305
Comparison of the Thresholds Contained in the Presidential Election and Recall Act and the Draft Initiative and Referendum Act.....	306
Application of the “Necessary & Proper” Test.....	428
Current Jurisdiction of the Council of Grand Justices over Constitutional Review.....	533

## List of Figures

The Evolution of the ROC Constitutional Structure.....	49
Checks and Balances among Three Branches under the US Constitution: “Ambition Must be Made to Counteract Ambition”.....	96/429
Checks and Balances among Five Branches under the ROC Constitution: “Separation with Equal and Balanced Footing”.....	97
National Sovereignty and Direct Democracy Design.....	307
The Fourth Branch under the Control of the Three Branches of Checks and Balances.....	391/430
The US Constitutional Structure: Checks and Balances Among Three Branches.....	503
The UK Constitutional Structure: Separation of Functions among Branches.....	504
The ROC Constitutional Structure under the 1946 Constitution.....	505
The ROC Constitutional Structure after the 1997 Constitutional Reform.....	506
Checks and Balances between the President and Legislative Yuan in the ROC.....	578
Checks and Balances between the President and Congress in the US.....	579

Checks and Balances between the Executive and Legislative  
Branches -- Taiwan and USA in Comparison.....580